

A newly identified Gondwanan terrane in the northern Appalachian Mountains: Implications for the Taconic orogeny and closure of the Iapetus Ocean

Francis A. Macdonald¹, Juliet Ryan-Davis², Raymond A. Coish², James L. Crowley³, and Paul M. Karabinos⁴

¹Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138, USA

²Geology Department, Middlebury College, Middlebury, Vermont 05753, USA

³Department of Geosciences, Boise State University, Boise, Idaho 83725, USA

⁴Department of Geology, Williams College, Williamstown, Massachusetts 01267, USA

We (Macdonald et al., 2014) used new geochronological data to delineate the suture between Laurentia and Gondwana in the New England Appalachians and reassess the tectonic evolution of the Taconic orogeny. Detrital zircon ages demonstrate that the Moretown Formation (Fm) was deposited on a peri-Gondwanan terrane, referred to as the Moretown terrane, and metamorphic and igneous ages suggest that it accreted to extended fragments of the rifted Laurentian margin, represented by the Rowe Schist, by 475 Ma. De Souza and Tremblay (2014) instead assert that the new detrital zircon data are consistent with a Laurentian provenance for the Moretown Fm, particularly from Neoproterozoic rift-related rocks, and they further claim that there is no evidence for a suture between the Moretown Fm and the Rowe Schist of the Laurentian margin.

De Souza and Tremblay begin by correlating the Cram Hill Fm in Vermont, which overlies the Moretown Fm, with the Saint-Daniel Mélange in Quebec, which they interpret as a Middle Ordovician foreland deposit that overlies rocks equivalent with the Moretown Fm. The Cram Hill Fm is correlated with the structurally highest rocks in the Hawley Fm, and Macdonald et al. (2014) showed that Laurentian detrital zircon contributed detritus to the Hawley Fm by ca. 475 Ma. Thus, De Souza and Tremblay's correlation is consistent with our model, which calls for accretion of the Moretown terrane by the Early Ordovician (ca. 475 Ma). De Souza and Tremblay are correct that the 502 ± 4 Ma age cited as a minimum age constraint on the Moretown Fm is from an intrusion in rocks mapped as Cram Hill Fm (Ratcliffe et al., 2011), but we suggest that the intruded rocks are better correlated with the Moretown Fm. Moreover, De Souza and Tremblay's assertion that the 502 ± 4 Ma intrusion is in the Cram Hill Fm is inconsistent with their correlation of the Cram Hill Fm with the 465–460 Ma Saint-Daniel Mélange.

De Souza and Tremblay cite Stanley and Ratcliffe (1985) to support their claim that the Moretown Fm was derived “in part from the erosion of metamorphosed rift clastics and volcanics exposed in the Green Mountains anticlinorium”. Stanley and Ratcliffe (1985, p. 1239) actually suggested that the Moretown Fm originated from “emerged parts of an accretionary wedge made up of older rocks now exposed in the Rowe Schist, Underhill, and equivalent formations” in a basin bounded by an accretionary wedge to the west and an island arc to the east. Our data demonstrate a dramatic difference in detrital zircon ages between the unarguably Laurentian-derived Rowe Schist and the Moretown Fm (Macdonald et al., 2014). Further evidence for a suture is provided by the high concentration of ultramafic lenses near this contact in New England (Ratcliffe et al., 2011).

De Souza and Tremblay's claim that the Moretown Fm was deposited at or after 475 Ma and contains detritus from Laurentian Neoproterozoic rift-related magmatism is unlikely for several reasons. Neoproterozoic zircon dominates the Moretown Fm, but constitute <5% of dated grains in Laurentian Paleozoic strata (Cawood and Nemchin, 2001). This is probably because Neoproterozoic mafic magmatism was zircon-poor and by 475 Ma was either eroded or deeply buried beneath younger

continental margin rocks. Hodych and Cox (2007) documented Laurentian plume- and rift-related magmatism between 615 and 550 Ma, which is younger than a large population of 700–615 Ma grains and older than seven grains from the Moretown Fm, which were dated with CA-TIMS between 545.7 ± 0.3 and 513.8 ± 0.6 Ma (Macdonald et al., 2014). Five of these grains were broken into two fragments that were dated separately and gave the same date, demonstrating that none of our dates are “too young” due to Pb loss or metamorphic overgrowths. The lack of 545–514 Ma Laurentian rift-related magmatism suggests these Moretown Fm grains are from elsewhere. The nearest rocks of this age occur in Ganderia (New River Fm; Fyffe et al., 2009). Finally, Neoproterozoic zircon from our Moretown Fm samples have moderately low Nb/Th, which is consistent with derivation from subduction-related rather than rift-related rocks (Tani et al., 2010).

Detrital zircon in Paleozoic strata of the Iapetus rifted margin of Laurentia are dominated by Mesoproterozoic Grenville grains (Cawood and Nemchin, 2001), whereas detrital zircon from sedimentary rocks on Gondwanan terranes are dominated by grains from late Neoproterozoic arcs (Fyffe et al., 2009). Our data demonstrate that this sharp contrast in provenance coincides with the Rowe Schist-Moretown Fm boundary. We suggest that the Early Ordovician (ca. 475 Ma) accretion of the peri-Gondwanan Moretown terrane to the peri-Laurentian Rowe belt, and their subsequent shared tectonic, depositional, and magmatic histories contributed to the cryptic nature of this suture. Our model predicts that younger syntectonic units such as the Saint-Daniel Mélange, Hawley Fm, and Cram Hill Fm should overlap both Laurentian and Gondwanan elements of the Taconic orogen.

REFERENCES CITED

- Cawood, P.A., and Nemchin, A.A., 2001, Paleogeographic development of the east Laurentian margin: Constraints from U-Pb dating of detrital zircons in the Newfoundland Appalachians: *Geological Society of America Bulletin*, v. 113, no. 9, p. 1234–1246, doi:10.1130/0016-7606(2001)113<1234:PDOTEL>2.0.CO;2.
- De Souza, S., and Tremblay, A., 2014, A newly identified Gondwanan terrane in the northern Appalachian Mountains: Implications for the Taconic orogeny and closure of the Iapetus Ocean: *Comment: Geology*, v. 43, p. e356.
- Fyffe, L.R., Barr, S.M., Johnson, S.C., McLeod, M.J., McNicoll, V.J., Valverde-Vaquero, P., van Staal, C.R., and White, C.E., 2009, Detrital zircon ages from Neoproterozoic and Early Paleozoic conglomerate and sandstone units of New Brunswick and coastal Maine: Implications for the tectonic evolution of Ganderia: *Atlantic Geology*, v. 45, p. 110–144.
- Hodych, J.P., and Cox, R.A., 2007, Ediacaran U-Pb zircon dates for the Lac Matapédia and Mt. St.-Anselme basalts of the Quebec Appalachians: Support for a long-lived mantle plume during the rifting phase of Iapetus opening: *Canadian Journal of Earth Sciences*, v. 44, no. 4, p. 565–581, doi:10.1139/e06-112.
- Macdonald, F.A., Ryan-Davis, J., Coish, R.A., Crowley, J.L., and Karabinos, P., 2014, A newly identified Gondwanan terrane in the northern Appalachian Mountains: Implications for the Taconic orogeny and closure of the Iapetus Ocean: *Geology*, v. 42, p. 539–542, doi:10.1130/G35659.1.
- Ratcliffe, N.M., Stanley, R.S., Gale, M.H., Thompson, P.J., Walsh, G.J., Hatch, N.L., Rankin, D.W., Doolan, B.L., Kim, J., Mehrtens, C.J., Aleinikoff, J.N., McHone, J.G., and Masonic, L.M., 2011, Bedrock geologic map of Vermont: U.S. Geological Survey, Scientific Investigations Map SIM-3184, scale 1:100,000.
- Stanley, R.S., and Ratcliffe, N.M., 1985, Tectonic synthesis of the Taconian orogeny in western New England: *Geological Society of America Bulletin*, v. 96, no. 10, p. 1227–1250, doi:10.1130/0016-7606(1985)96<1227:TSOTTO>2.0.CO;2.
- Tani, K., Dunkley, D.J., Kimura, J.I., Wysoczanski, R.J., Yamada, K., and Tsumi, Y., 2010, Syncollisional rapid granitic magma formation in an arc-arc collision zone: Evidence from the Tanzawa plutonic complex, Japan: *Geology*, v. 38, no. 3, p. 215–218, doi:10.1130/G30526.

Geology

A newly identified Gondwanan terrane in the northern Appalachian Mountains: Implications for the Taconic orogeny and closure of the Iapetus Ocean: REPLY

Francis A. Macdonald, Juliet Ryan-Davis, Raymond A. Coish, James L. Crowley and Paul M. Karabinos

Geology 2015;43:e360
doi: 10.1130/G36575Y.1

Email alerting services click www.gsapubs.org/cgi/alerts to receive free e-mail alerts when new articles cite this article

Subscribe click www.gsapubs.org/subscriptions/ to subscribe to *Geology*

Permission request click <http://www.geosociety.org/pubs/copyrt.htm#gsa> to contact GSA

Copyright not claimed on content prepared wholly by U.S. government employees within scope of their employment. Individual scientists are hereby granted permission, without fees or further requests to GSA, to use a single figure, a single table, and/or a brief paragraph of text in subsequent works and to make unlimited copies of items in GSA's journals for noncommercial use in classrooms to further education and science. This file may not be posted to any Web site, but authors may post the abstracts only of their articles on their own or their organization's Web site providing the posting includes a reference to the article's full citation. GSA provides this and other forums for the presentation of diverse opinions and positions by scientists worldwide, regardless of their race, citizenship, gender, religion, or political viewpoint. Opinions presented in this publication do not reflect official positions of the Society.

Notes