

English 9002A  
Bibliography and Textual Studies  
Michael Groden  
October 21, 2013  
Textual Sociology

**next week:**

Medieval Editing  
guest speaker: Richard Moll

Anne Hudson, "Middle English"  
in *Editing Medieval Texts:  
English, French, and Latin Written in England*  
edited by A.G. Rigg  
New York: AMS Press, 1977, pp. 34-57  
copy in Leanne Trask's office, UC 180

**important terms and names from Oct. 7**

stemma  
best-text editing  
copy-text  
W. W. Greg  
copy-text editing  
substantives  
accidentals  
emend  
Fredson Bowers  
final authorial intention  
critical edition  
~~definitive~~

**important terms and names from today**

sociology of texts  
social theory of editing  
D. F. McKenzie  
Jerome McGann

**W.W. Greg – "The Rationale of  
Copy-Text" (1949, pub. 1950-51)**

- 1) text = "substantives" and "accidentals"
- 2) editor chooses copy-text for accidentals (copy-text: different concept from setting text)  
-> what author wrote
  - copy-text chosen for expediency
  - editor can then emend substantives
- 3) avoid "tyranny of the copy-text"
- 4) indifferent variants: follow copy-text
- 5) copy-text = text of "divided authority"  
but "presumptive authority"

**Fredson Bowers (1950s-80s)**

adapt methods designed for Shakespeare to other authors: Dekker, Dryden, Fielding, Hawthorne, Crane, Nabokov  
editing based on "New Bibliography"  
(analytical and descriptive)  
recreate "final authorial intention"  
"veil of print"  
"where are *Hamlet* and *Lycidas*?": in author's mind  
eventually substantive/accidental distinction dropped  
resulting edited text = eclectic text  
but founded on bibliographic principles

**critical edition**

result of scholarly editing:  
critical edition  
= edition with critically established text  
that is, text is result of acts of criticism  
(compare to "Norton Critical Edition")  
*not* "definitive" (can't be)

**Greg-Bowers editing as orthodoxy**

Modern Language Association of America's  
Center for Editions of American Authors  
(CEAA)

later: Center for Scholarly Editions (CSE)  
Carleton University's Centre for Editing Early  
Canadian Texts

by 1960s-70s, by far the most common way of  
editing

**critical edition**

presentation:  
modernize?  
regularize?  
clear text or marked-up text?  
include apparatus? form of it?  
lemma? or something different

**works in extremely different versions**

Shakespeare's *King Lear*

Wordsworth's *The Prelude*

W.B. Yeats, "The Sorrow of Love" (1895, 1925)

The quarrel of the sparrows in the eaves,  
The full round moon and the star-laden sky,  
And the loud song of the ever-singing leaves,  
Had had away earth's old and weary cry.

And then you came with those red mournful lips,  
And with you came the whole of the world's tears,  
And all the sorrows of her labouring ships,  
And all the burden of her myriad years.

And now the sparrows warring in the eaves,  
The curd-pale moon, the white stars in the sky,  
And the loud chaunting of the unquiet leaves,  
Are shaken with earth's old and weary cry.

1895 version

The brawling of a sparrow in the eaves,  
The brilliant moon and all the milky sky,  
And all that famous harmony of leaves,  
Had blotted out man's image and his cry.

A girl arose that had red mournful lips  
And seemed the greatness of the world in tears,  
Doomed like Odysseus and the labouring ships  
And proud as Priam murdered with his peers;

Arose, and on the instant clamorous eaves,  
A climbing moon upon an empty sky,  
And all that lamentation of the leaves,  
Could but compose man's image and his cry.

1925 version

**Greg-Bowers editing - assumptions**

"final authorial intention"  
G. Thomas Tanselle (1976): editor must  
"reconstruct the text intended by the author"  
unity, organic (New Criticism: "verbal icon,"  
"well-wrought urn" but also author)  
nature of "work" and "text"  
Platonic, mystical  
Yeats: "monuments of unageing intellect"  
(cited by Tanselle)

**Greg-Bowers editing - attitudes**

"Many a literary critic has investigated the past  
ownership and mechanical condition of his second-  
hand automobile, or the pedigree and training of his  
dog, more thoroughly than he has looked into the  
qualifications of the text on which his theories  
rest." (Fredson Bowers, 1949)

"Every practicing critic, for the humility of his soul,  
ought to study the transmission of some appropriate  
text." (Fredson Bowers, 1949)

### Greg-Bowers Editing - objections

- 1) claim of science and objectively-based judgment, but revert to intention
- 2) concept of author: author not always "creative" (Hershel Parker)
- 3) author not alone: editors, publishers, friends, reviewers, actors, producers (Jerome McGann)  
F. Scott Fitzgerald and Thomas Wolfe  
+ editor Maxwell Perkins  
Raymond Carver + editor Gordon Lish  
Sir Walter Scott + authorized scribes
- 4) avoids historical conditions (D. F. McKenzie)
- 5) why edit at all? (Randall McLeod)

### Greg-Bowers editing - other alternatives

D. F. McKenzie's "sociology of texts":  
sociological history of books and texts  
Jerome McGann's "social theory of editing"  
versions and versioning (Hans Zeller)  
synoptic, genetic editions (Zailig Pollock's A. M. Klein)  
multiple texts:  
new Shakespeare editions, Marianne Moore  
not "veil of print" (Bowers), but drafts or versions  
hypertext editing:  
Jerome McGann's "The Rationale of Hypertext"  
different assumptions -> different editions  
(and different texts):  
author (writing, intention) / multiple producers /  
reception

D. F. McKenzie, *Bibliography and the Sociology of Texts* (1986, rpt. 1999)

From

"What the bibliographer is concerned with is pieces of paper on parchment covered with certain written or printed signs. With these signs he is concerned merely as arbitrary marks; their meaning is no business of his."  
(W. W. Greg [1932], cited in McKenzie, p. 9)

D. F. McKenzie, *Bibliography and the Sociology of Texts* (1986, rpt. 1999)

To

"bibliography is the discipline that studies texts as recorded forms, and the processes of their transmission, including their production and reception" (p. 12)

"a sociology of texts" (pp. 13, 15)

"a complex relation of medium to meaning" (p. 18)

"Bibliography . . . can, in short, show the human presence in any recorded text." (p. 29)

D. F. McKenzie, *Bibliography and the Sociology of Texts* (1986, rpt. 1999)

He owns, with Toil, he wrought the following Scenes,  
But if they're naught ne'er spare him for his Pains:  
Damn him the more; have no Commiseration  
For Dulness on mature Deliberation.

(William Congreve, 1710)

He owns with toil he wrote the following scenes;  
But if they're naught, ne'er spare him for his pains:  
Damn him the more; have no commiseration  
For dullness on mature deliberation.

(used as epigraph in Wimsatt and Beardsley,  
"The Intentional Fallacy," 1946)